



GRETCHEN WHITMER
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF
ENVIRONMENT, GREAT LAKES, AND ENERGY
BAY CITY DISTRICT OFFICE



LIESL EICHLER CLARK
DIRECTOR

May 31, 2022

Eric Rupprecht
Michigan Sugar Company – Bay City
2600 South Euclid Avenue
Bay City, Michigan 48706

SRN: B1493, Bay County

Dear Eric Rupprecht:

VIOLATION NOTICE

On May 12, 2022, the Department of Environment, Great Lakes, and Energy (EGLE), Air Quality Division (AQD), conducted an inspection in the area near Michigan Sugar Company – Bay City located at 2600 South Euclid Avenue, Bay City, Michigan (MSC BC). The purpose of this inspection was to determine compliance with the requirements of the federal Clean Air Act; Part 55, Air Pollution Control, of the Natural Resources and Environmental Protection Act, 1994 PA 451, as amended (Act 451); the Air Pollution Control Rules; and to investigate recent complaints which we received between April 22 and May 12, 2022, regarding foul odors attributed to MSC BC operations.

During the inspection, staff observed the following:

Process Description	Rule/Permit Condition Violated	Comments
Flume ponds and aeration ponds	Rule 901 and ROP No. MI-ROP-B1493-2016, General Condition 12.	Odors in residential area associated with low oxygen in facility ponds due to hydraulic and organic overloading.
Channel and beet piling grounds	Rule 901 and ROP No. MI-ROP-B1493-2016, General Condition 12.	Odors in residential area associated with rotting vegetable matter/beets.

In the professional judgment of AQD staff, the odors that were observed were of sufficient intensity, frequency, and duration so as to constitute a violation of Rule 901 of the administrative rules promulgated under Act 451 (“the Act”) and General Condition 12 of ROP number MI-ROP-B1493-2016.

The AQD staff conducted an odor observation survey and detected strong offensive odors in residential areas near the company downwind of the facility.

Eric Rupprecht
Michigan Sugar Company – Bay City
Page 2
May 31, 2022

On the MSC BC site AQD staff observed a sour milk-like odor as we traveled the area between the flume clarifier and the anaerobic digester. The flume clarifier was near full with solids from the campaign. A slight manure and sour odor was present near the Outer pond. A slight septic odor was noted near the Final flume pond.

The rotting Chip and Tail pieces previously stored in an area south of the Flume ponds have been removed. Some of the ground was black and appeared saturated with residual rotting beet juice. The Channel was still full of thick, black, septic, and foamy material and there was a slight rotting beet odor.

A mix of manure and sour milk-like odors were present at the East and West aeration ponds, and a strong mix of septic and manure like odors were observed near the New and the Final aeration ponds.

During AQD's odor investigation, staff observed grey to black water in the East, West, New, and the Final aeration ponds. All aeration ponds were reported to have dissolved oxygen levels below 1 mg/l.

Please submit a written response to this Violation Notice by June 21, 2022 (which coincides with 21 calendar days from the date of this letter). The written response should include an explanation of the causes of the violations; actions taken or planned that are necessary to correct the cited violations and the dates by which these actions will take place; and what steps are being taken to prevent a reoccurrence.

In your response include the following for the period of April 22 through May 12, 2022:

- The last date wastewater was removed from the Main Aeration Pond;
- The dates MSC BC applied hydrogen peroxide to the Main Aeration Pond;
- The dates MSC BC operated odor neutralizing equipment;
- Any records of odor complaints MSC BC received; and
- The amount and dates of material removed from the flume clarifier.

Please submit the written response to Chris Hare, EGLE, AQD, Bay City District, at 401 Ketchum Street, Suite B, Bay City, Michigan 48708 and submit a copy to Jenine Camilleri, Enforcement Unit Supervisor at EGLE, AQD, P.O. Box 30260, Lansing, Michigan 48909-7760.

If MSC BC believes the above observations or statements are inaccurate or do not constitute violations of the applicable legal requirements cited, please provide appropriate factual information to explain your position.

Thank you for your attention to resolving the violation cited above and for the cooperation that was extended to me during my inspection of the odor complaints. If you have any questions regarding the violation or the actions necessary to bring this

Eric Rupprecht
Michigan Sugar Company – Bay City
Page 3
May 31, 2022

facility into compliance, please contact me at the number listed below or at
brewerk@michigan.gov.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Kathy Brewer". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, stylized "K" and "B".

Kathy Brewer
Senior Environmental Quality Analyst
Air Quality Division
989 439-2100

cc: Kelly Scheffler, MSC BC
Meaghan Martuch, MSC BC
Angel Pichla, MSC BC
Laura Doud, MDARD
Charles Bauer, EGLE
Mary Ann Dolehanty, EGLE
Dr. Eduardo Olaguer, EGLE
Jenine Camilleri, EGLE
Christopher Ethridge, EGLE
Chris Hare, EGLE